# Discrete Operators and Equations: Analysis and Comparison 

Alexander Vasilyev, Vladimir Vasilyev, and Asad Esmatullah


#### Abstract

We develop a discrete variant of a theory of pseudo-differential equations and boundary value problems in canonical domains which are model situations for manifolds with non-smooth boundaries. Using digitization process for ordinary functional spaces we construct certain discrete functional spaces or spaces of functions of a discrete variable and define discrete pseudo-differential operators acting in such spaces. A main problem in which we are interested is to establish a correspondence between continual and discrete solutions of considered continual and discrete equations and in future boundary value problems. We have illustrated our considerations by certain examples of Calderon-Zygmund operators for which we have some interesting conclusions.


Keywords Discrete operator • Solvability

## 1 Introduction

We deal with some special operators namely pseudo-differential operators. Our global main goal is to construct a theory of discrete pseudo-differential operators and corresponding boundary value problems on smooth manifolds with a boundary which may be non-smooth.

A basic equation in an operator form is the following

$$
\begin{equation*}
(A u)(x)=v(x), \quad x \in D, \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $D \subset \mathbf{R}^{m}$ is a some domain, $A$ is a pseudo-differential operator which is defined by the formula

[^0]\[

$$
\begin{equation*}
(A u)(x)=(2 \pi)^{-m} \int_{D} \int_{\mathbf{R}^{m}} e^{i(y-x) \cdot \xi} \tilde{A}(x, \xi) \tilde{u}(\xi) d y d \xi, \quad x \in D, \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

\]

and a sign $\sim$ over the function $u$ denotes its Fourier transform

$$
\tilde{u}(\xi)=\int_{\mathbf{R}^{m}} e^{-i x \xi} u(x) d x
$$

Definition 1 The function $\tilde{A}(x, \xi)$ is called a symbol of a pseudo-differential operator $A$. A symbol $\tilde{A}(x, \xi)$ is called an elliptic symbol if ess $\inf _{(x, \xi) \in \mathbf{R}^{m} \times \mathbf{R}^{m}}|\tilde{A}(x, \xi)|>0$.

As far as I know it is impossible to find an exact solution of the equation (1) for an arbitrary domain $D$. Therefore all researches are interested in describing Fredholm properties of the equation at least. But for simplest cases it can very easy by the Fourier transform.

Example 1 Let $\mathrm{K}(\mathrm{x})$ be a Calderon-Zygmund kernel and the operator $\boldsymbol{A}$ is defined by the formula [4]

$$
\begin{equation*}
(K u)(x)=v \cdot p \cdot \int_{\mathbf{R}^{m}} K(x-y) u(y) d y \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

so that it can represented in the form (6)

$$
(K u)(x)=(2 \pi)^{-m} \int_{\mathbf{R}^{m}} \int_{\mathbf{R}^{m}} e^{i(y-x)-\xi} \sigma(\xi) \tilde{u}(\xi) d y d \xi,
$$

and the function $\sigma(\xi)$ is called a symbol of the operator $A$. It is well known that for the operator $A$ to be invertible in the space $L_{2}\left(\mathbf{R}^{m}\right)$ necessary and sufficient its symbol $\sigma(\xi)$ should be an elliptic [4].

Let $D_{d}=D \cap h \mathbf{Z}^{m}, h>0$. We are interested in studying some discrete equations which we call discrete pseudo-differential equations and which are related to the Eq. (1). Let us define a discrete pseudo-differential operator by the formula

$$
\left(A_{d} u_{d}\right)(\tilde{x})=\sum_{\tilde{y} \in D_{d} \tilde{T}^{\mathbf{T}}} \int e^{i(\tilde{y}-\bar{x}) \cdot \xi} A_{d}(\tilde{x}, \xi) \tilde{u}_{d}(\xi) d \xi, \quad \tilde{x} \in D_{d}
$$

where $u_{d}(\tilde{x})$ is a function of a discrete variable $\tilde{x} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}, \tilde{u}_{d}(\xi)$ denotes its discrete Fourier transform

$$
\begin{equation*}
\bar{u}_{d}(\xi) \equiv\left(F_{d} u_{d}\right)(\xi)=\sum_{\bar{y} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}} e^{i \bar{y} \xi} \bar{u}_{d}(y), \quad \xi \in \hbar \mathbf{T}^{m} \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

$\mathbf{Z}^{m}$ is an integer lattice in $\mathbf{R}^{m}, \mathbf{T}^{m}$ is m-dimensional cube $[-\pi, \pi]^{m}, \hbar=\frac{h^{-1}}{2 \pi}$, and given function $A_{d}(\bar{x}, \xi), \tilde{x} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}, \xi \in \hbar \mathbf{T}^{m}$, is called a symbol of the discrete pseudo-differential operator $A_{d}$.

We would like to study the equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left(A_{d} u_{d}\right)(\tilde{x})=v_{d}(\tilde{x}), \quad \tilde{x} \in D_{d}, \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

in some discrete functional spaces. Since it is difficult to study such general operators (as it was said above) for discrete cases also we'll consider certain model situations.

## 2 The Concept of the Research

We'll present here main ideas for studying this large problem. In contrast of algebraic approaches $[2,3,5]$ we use analytical methods based on properties of the Fourier transform and considered operators. A plan of the studying is the following:

- infinite discrete and finite discrete Fourier transform
- discrete functional spaces
- solvability of infinite discrete equation
- solvability of finite discrete equation
- comparison of continual and infinite discrete solution
- comparison of infinite and finite discrete solution.


### 2.1 Local Discrete Operators

We'll illustrated the above scheme with very simple model pseudo-differential operator namely operator $A$ from example 1 because many our results are related to this operator. In addition we assume that kernel $K(x)$ of the operator $A$ is differentiable on $\mathbf{R}^{m} \backslash\{0\}$.

### 2.2 Discrete and Continual

Discrete Fourier Transform To obtain a good approximation for the integral equation (1) we will use the following reduction. First instead of the integral in (1) we introduce the series

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sum_{\tilde{y} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}} K(\tilde{x}-\tilde{y}) u_{d}(\tilde{y}) h^{m}, \tag{6}
\end{equation*}
$$

which generates a discrete operator

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left(K_{d} u_{d}\right)(\tilde{x})=\sum_{\tilde{y} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}} K(\tilde{x}-\tilde{y}) u_{d}(\tilde{y}) h^{m}, \quad \tilde{x} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m} \tag{7}
\end{equation*}
$$

defined on functions $u_{d}$ of discrete variable $\tilde{x} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}$. Since the Calderon-Zygmund kernel has a strong singularity at the origin we mean $K(0)=0$. Convergence for the series (6) means that the following limit

$$
\lim _{N \rightarrow+\infty} \sum_{\tilde{y} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m} \cap Q_{N}} K(\tilde{x}-\bar{y}) u_{d}(\bar{y}) h^{m}
$$

exists, where $Q_{N}=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{m}: \max _{1 \leq k \leq m}\left|x_{k}\right|<N\right\}$. It was shown earlier that a norm of the operator $K_{d}: L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}^{m}\right) \rightarrow L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}^{m}\right)$ does not depend on $h$ [11]. But although the operator is a discrete object it is an infinite one.

Let us define the infinite discrete Fourier transform for functions $u_{d}$ of a discrete variable $\tilde{x} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}$

$$
\left(F_{d} u_{d}\right)(\xi)=\sum_{\tilde{x} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}} u_{d}(\tilde{x}) e^{i \bar{x} \xi} h^{m}, \quad \xi \in \hbar \mathbf{T}^{m} .
$$

Such discrete Fourier transform preserves all basic properties of the classical Fourier transform, particularly for a discrete convolution of two discrete functions $u_{d}, v_{d}$

$$
\left(u_{d} * v_{d}\right)(\tilde{x}) \equiv \sum_{\tilde{y} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}} u_{d}(\tilde{x}-\tilde{y}) v_{d}(\tilde{y}) h^{m}
$$

we have the well known multiplication property

$$
\left(F_{d}\left(u_{d} * v_{d}\right)\right)(\xi)=\left(F_{d} u_{d}\right)(\xi) \cdot\left(F_{d} v_{d}\right)(\xi) .
$$

If we apply this property to the operator $K_{d}$ we obtain

$$
\left(F_{d}\left(K_{d} u_{d}\right)\right)(\xi)=\left(F_{d} K_{d}\right)(\xi) \cdot\left(F_{d} u_{d}\right)(\xi) .
$$

Let us denote $\left(F_{d} K_{d}\right)(\xi) \equiv \sigma_{d}(\xi)$ and give the following
Definition 2 The function $\sigma_{d}(\xi), \xi \in \hbar \mathbf{T}^{m}$, is called a symbol of the discrete operator $K_{d}$.

We will assume below that the symbol $\sigma_{d}(\xi) \in C\left(\hbar \mathbf{T}^{m}\right)$ therefore we have immediately the following

Property 1 The operator $K_{d}$ is invertible in the space $L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}^{m}\right)$ iff $\sigma_{d}(\xi) \neq 0, \forall \xi \in$ $\hbar \mathbf{T}^{m}$.

We say that a continuous symbol is called an elliptic symbol if $\sigma_{d}(\xi) \neq 0, \forall \xi \in$ $\hbar \mathbf{T}^{m}$.

So we see that an arbitrary elliptic symbol $\sigma_{d}(\xi)$ corresponds to an invertible operator $K_{d}$ in the space $L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}^{m}\right)$.

A very interesting fact was proved in $[8,9]$.
Theorem 1 Operators (3) and (7) are invertible or non-invertible in spaces $L_{2}\left(\mathbf{R}^{m}\right)$ and $L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}^{m}\right)$ simultaneously $\forall h>0$.

If we consider the equation

$$
\left(K_{d} u_{d}\right)(\tilde{x})=v_{d}(\tilde{x}), \quad \tilde{x} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}
$$

in the space $L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}^{m}\right)$ then we solve the equation by the discrete Fourier transform $F_{d}$. Indeed after applying the Fourier transform we have the trivial equation

$$
\sigma_{d}(\xi) \tilde{u}_{d}(\xi)=\tilde{v}_{d}(\xi), \quad \xi \in \hbar \mathbf{T}^{m}
$$

in the dual space $L_{2}\left(\hbar \mathbf{T}^{m}\right)$.
We have first difficulties when consider this equation in the space $L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}_{+}^{m}\right)$, where $\mathbf{Z}_{+}^{m}=\left\{\tilde{x} \in \mathbf{Z}^{m}: \tilde{x}=\left(\tilde{x}_{1}, \ldots, \tilde{x}_{m}\right), \tilde{x}_{m}>0\right\}$. We can not apply the Fourier transform directly as above because the functions under consideration are defined not on a whole space. Thus we need to describe images of such function after the discrete Fourier transform, ant it leads us to the next extensions.

A Half-Space Case If we consider Eqs. (3) and (7) in spaces $L_{2}\left(\mathbf{R}_{+}^{m}\right)$ and $L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}_{+}^{m}\right)$ or in other words operators $K: L_{2}\left(\mathbf{R}_{+}^{m}\right) \rightarrow L_{2}\left(\mathbf{R}_{+}^{m}\right)$ and $K_{d}: L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}_{+}^{m}\right) \rightarrow L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}_{+}^{m}\right)$ then for studying invertibility of the operator $K_{d}$ one has constructed a special periodic Riemann boundary value problem [10]. A solvability of mentioned Riemann problem depends on a certain topological invariant æ related to a symbol of an elliptic operator. This number $æ$ is called an index of periodic Riemann boundary value problem. It was shown these topological numbers for elliptic operators $K$ and $K_{d}$ are the same and it implies the following [8, 9]

Theorem 2 Operators (3) and (7) are invertible or non-invertible in spaces $L_{2}\left(\mathbf{R}_{+}^{m}\right)$ and $L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}_{+}^{m}\right)$ simultaneously $\forall h>0$.

Studying more complicated situations related to cones [6] was started in [14], first steps were done.

Discrete Boundary Value Problems These arise first in the case $h \mathbf{Z}_{+}^{m}$ then we have a boundary, and it is possible the mentioned index $x$ is not a zero. To exclude a non-uniqueness of solution one needs some boundary conditions [1, 6]. Some similar situations were considered for difference equations in papers $[12,13,15]$.

### 2.3 Infinite and Finite

Finite Discrete Fourier Transform Here we will introduce a special discrete periodic kernel $K_{d, N}(\tilde{x})$ which is defined in the following way. We take a restriction of the discrete kernel $K_{d}(\tilde{x})$ on the set $Q_{N} \cap h \mathbf{Z}^{m} \equiv Q_{N}^{d}$ and periodically continue it to a whole $h \mathbf{Z}^{m}$. Further we consider discrete periodic functions $u_{d, N}$ with discrete cube of periods $Q_{N}^{d}$. We can define a cyclic convolution for a pair of such functions $u_{d, N}, v_{d, N}$ by the formula

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left(u_{d, N} * v_{d, N}\right)(\tilde{x})=\sum_{\tilde{y} \in Q_{N}^{d}} u_{d, N}(\tilde{x}-\tilde{y}) v_{d, N}(\tilde{y}) h^{m} \tag{8}
\end{equation*}
$$

Further we introduce finite discrete Fourier transform by the formula

$$
\left(F_{d, N} u_{d, N}\right)(\tilde{\xi})=\sum_{\tilde{x} \in Q_{N}^{d}} u_{d, N}(\tilde{x}) e^{i \tilde{x} \tilde{\xi}} h^{m}, \quad \tilde{\xi} \in R_{N}^{d}
$$

where $R_{N}^{d}=\hbar \mathbf{T}^{m} \cap \hbar \mathbf{Z}^{m}$. Let us note that here $\bar{\xi}$ is a discrete variable.
Finite Discrete Operator According to the formula (8) one can introduce the operator

$$
K_{d, N} u_{d, N}(\tilde{x})=\sum_{\tilde{y} \in Q_{N}^{d}} K_{d, N}(\tilde{x}-\tilde{y}) u_{d, N}(\tilde{y}) h^{m}
$$

on periodic discrete functions $u_{d, N}$ and a finite discrete Fourier transform for its kernel

$$
\sigma_{d, N}(\tilde{\xi})=\sum_{\tilde{x} \in Q_{N}^{d}} K_{d, N}(\tilde{x}) e^{i \tilde{x} \tilde{\xi}} h^{m}, \quad \tilde{\xi} \in R_{N}^{d} .
$$

Definition 3 A function $\sigma_{d, N}(\tilde{\xi}), \tilde{\xi} \in R_{N}^{d}$, is called s symbol of the operator $K_{d, N}$. This symbol is called an elliptic symbol if $\sigma_{d, N}(\tilde{\xi}) \neq 0, \forall \tilde{\xi} \in R_{N}^{d}$.

Theorem 3 Let $\sigma_{d}(\xi)$ be an elliptic symbol. Then for enough large $N$ the symbol $\sigma_{d, N}(\tilde{\xi})$ is elliptic symbol also.

A proof of the theorem follows immediately.
As before an elliptic symbol $\sigma_{d, N}(\tilde{\xi})$ corresponds to the invertible operator $K_{d, N}$ in the space $L_{2}\left(Q_{N}^{d}\right)$.

## 3 Discrete Functional Spaces

Since we'll use projectors on points of lattice we need subspaces of continuous functions instead of Lebesgue spaces. We introduce the space $C_{h}$ which is the space of functions $u_{d}$ of discrete variable $\tilde{x} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}$ with the norm

$$
\left\|u_{d}\right\|_{C_{h}}=\max _{\tilde{x} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}}\left|u_{d}(\tilde{x})\right|
$$

In other words, the space $C_{h}$ is the space of functions $u \in C\left(\mathbf{R}^{m}\right)$ restricted on lattice points $\mathbf{Z}_{h}^{m}$. Here we remind, that the operator $K$ isn't bounded in the space $C\left(\mathbf{R}^{m}\right)$, but it is bounded in the space $L_{2}\left(\mathbf{R}^{m}\right)$, and it is well-known, that if the right hand side of the equation

$$
(K u)(x)=v(x)
$$

has some smoothness properties (for example, it satisfies the Hölder condition), then the solution of this (if it exists in the space $L_{2}\left(\mathbf{R}^{m}\right)$ ) has the same smoothness property [4].

Further we define the discrete space $C_{h}(\alpha, \beta)$ as a functional space of discrete variable $\tilde{x} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}$ with finite norm

$$
\left\|u_{d}\right\|_{C_{h}(\alpha, \beta)}=\left\|u_{d}\right\|_{C_{h}}+\sup _{\tilde{x}, \tilde{y} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}}\left|u_{d}(\tilde{x})-u_{d}(\tilde{y})\right|,
$$

and additional assumptions

$$
\begin{gathered}
\left|u_{d}(\tilde{x})-u_{d}(\tilde{y})\right| \leq c \frac{|\tilde{x}-\tilde{y}|^{\alpha}}{(\max \{1+|\tilde{x}|, 1+|\tilde{y}|\})^{\beta}}, \\
\left|u_{d}(\tilde{x})\right| \leq \frac{c}{(1+|\tilde{x}|)^{\beta-\alpha}}, \quad \forall \tilde{x}, \tilde{y} \in h \mathbf{Z}^{m}, \alpha, \beta>0,0<\alpha<1 .
\end{gathered}
$$

## 4 Approximate Solutions

### 4.1 Infinite Discrete Solutions

Let's denote $P_{h}$ the restriction operator on the lattice $h \mathbf{Z}^{m}$, i.e. the operator, which an arbitrary function, defined on $\mathbf{R}^{m}$, maps to the set of its discrete values in lattice points $h \mathbf{Z}^{m}$.

Definition 4 The approximation rate for the operators $K$ and $K_{d}$ in vector normed space $X$ of functions defined on $\mathbf{R}^{m}$, is called the operator norm

$$
\left\|P_{h} K-K_{d} P_{h}\right\|_{X \rightarrow X_{d}},
$$

where $X_{d}$ is the normed space of functions defined on the lattice $h \mathbf{Z}^{m}$ with norm, which is induced by the norm of the space $X$.

For the space $C_{h}(\alpha, \beta)$ we have

Theorem 4 If $m<\beta<\alpha+m$, then the estimate

$$
\left\|K_{d} u_{d}\right\|_{C_{h}(\alpha, \beta)} \leq c\left\|u_{d}\right\|_{C_{h}(\alpha, \beta)}
$$

is valid, and $c$ doesn't depend on $h$.
The continual analogue of such spaces is the space $H_{\beta}^{\alpha}\left(\mathbf{R}^{m}\right)$ of functions, which are continuous in $\mathbf{R}^{m}$ and satisfy the Hölder condition of order $0<\alpha<1$ and with weight $(1+|x|)^{\beta}$. It is well known from results of S.K. Abdullaev (Sov. Math., Dokl. 40, No.2, 417-421,1990) that the operator $K$ is a linear bounded operator $K: H_{\beta}^{\alpha}\left(\mathbf{R}^{m}\right) \rightarrow H_{\beta}^{\alpha}\left(\mathbf{R}^{m}\right)$ under the condition $m<\beta<\alpha+m$.

We will give the approximation rate for the operators $K$ and $K_{d}$ in the space $C_{h}(\alpha, \beta)$. It will permit to obtain the error estimate for approximate solution, if we will change the continual operator $K$ by its discrete analogue $K_{d}$.

Theorem 5 The approximate rate for the operators $K$ and $K_{d}$ is the following

$$
\left\|P_{h} K-K_{d} P_{h}\right\|_{C_{h}(\alpha, \beta)} \leq c h^{\tilde{\alpha}}
$$

where $c$ doesn't depend on $h, \bar{\alpha}<\alpha, \tilde{\beta}>\beta$.
Some of these results were obtained in [7].

### 4.2 Finite Discrete Solutions

Let us denote $P_{N}$ the projector $L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}^{m}\right) \rightarrow L_{2}\left(Q_{N}^{d}\right)$.
Theorem 6 For operators $K_{d}$ and $K_{d, N}$ we have the following estimate

$$
\left\|\left(P_{N} K_{d}-K_{d, N} P_{N}\right) u_{d}\right\|_{L_{2}\left(Q_{N}^{d}\right)} \leq C N^{m+2(\alpha-\beta)}
$$

for arbitrary $u_{d} \in C_{h}(\alpha, \beta), \beta>\alpha+m / 2$.
Now we consider the equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
K_{d, N} u_{d, N}=P_{N} v_{d} \tag{9}
\end{equation*}
$$

instead of the equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
K_{d} u_{d}=v_{d} \tag{10}
\end{equation*}
$$

and give a comparison for these two solutions assuming that operator $K_{d}$ is invertible in $L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}^{m}\right)$.

Theorem 7 If $v_{d} \in C_{h}(\alpha, \beta), \beta>\alpha+m / 2, u_{d}$ is a solution of the Eq. (10), $u_{d, N}$ is a solution of (9) then the estimate

$$
\left\|u_{d}-u_{d, N}\right\|_{L_{2}\left(h \mathbf{Z}^{m}\right)} \leq C N^{m+2(\alpha-\beta)}
$$

is valid, and $C$ is a constant non-depending on $N$.

## Conclusion

These considerations are first steps to realize the declared programm. We hope that obtained results will help us to study more general discrete operators and equations and to describe a correspondence between discrete and continual objects, and also between finite and infinite discrete objects.

## References

1. Eskin G (1981) Boundary value problems for elliptic pseudodifferential equations. AMS, Providence
2. Didenko V, Silbermann B (2008) Approximation of additive convolution-like operators. Real $C^{*}$-algebra approach. Birkhäuser, Basel
3. Hagen R, Roch S, Silbermann B (2001) $C^{*}$-algebras and numerical analysis. Marcel Dekker, New York
4. Mikhlin SG, Prössdorf S (1986) Singular integral operators. Akademie-Verlag, Berlin
5. Prössdorf S, Silbermann B (1991) Numerical analysis for integral and related operator equations. Birkhäuser, Basel
6. Vasil'ev VB (2000) Wave factorization of elliptic symbols: theory and applications. Kluwer, Dordrecht
7. Vasilyev AV, Vasilyev VB (2012) Numerical analysis for some singular integral equations. Neural Parall Sci Comput 20:313-326
8. Vasilyev AV, Vasilyev VB (2013) Discrete singular operators and equations in a half-space. Azerb J Math 3:84-93
9. Vasilyev AV, Vasilyev VB (2015) Discrete singular integrals in a half-space. In: Mityushev V, Ruzhansky M (eds) Current trends in analysis and its applications. Proceedings of 9th ISAAC congress, Kraków, Poland, 2013. Birkhäuser, Basel, pp 663-670
10. Vasilyev AV, Vasilyev VB (2015) Periodic Riemann problem and discrete convolution equations. Differ Equ 51:652-660
11. Vasil'ev AV, Vasil'ev VB (2015) On the solvability of certain discrete equations and related estimates of discrete operators. Dokl Math 92:585-589
12. Vasilyev AV, Vasilyev VB (2016) On solvability of some difference-discrete equations. Opusc Math 36:525-539
13. Vasilyev AV, Vasilyev VB (2016) Difference equations in a multidimensional space. Math Model Anal 21:336-349
14. Vasilyev VB (2016) Discrete equations and periodic wave factorization. AIP Conf Proc 1759:0200126
15. Vasilyev AV, Vasilyev VB (2016) Difference equations and boundary value problems. In: Pinelas S et al (eds) Differential and difference equations and applications. Springer proceeding mathematics \& statistics vol 164. Birkhäuser, Basel, pp 421-432

[^0]:    A. Vasilyev (凶) • V. Vasilyev • A. Esmatullah

    Belgorod State National Research University, Belgorod 308015, Russia
    e-mail: alexvassel @gmail.com

